



Council of the European Union  
General Secretariat

**Brussels, 18 December 2019**

**WK 14394/2019 INIT**

**LIMITE**

**RECH**

**WORKING PAPER**

*This is a paper intended for a specific community of recipients. Handling and further distribution are under the sole responsibility of community members.*

**WORKING DOCUMENT**

---

From:	ERAC Secretariat
To:	ERAC (European Research Area and Innovation Committee)
Subject:	ERAC WS 16th December 2019 BRAIN CIRCULATION- how to address negative influences and how to maximize the benefits

---

Delegations will find attached the PowerPoint presentation concerning the item 5 of the ERAC plenary agenda of 17 December 2019.

# ERAC WS 16<sup>th</sup> December 2019

## BRAIN CIRCULATION- how to address negative influences and how to maximize the benefits

- a) Collaborative networks
- b) Inclusiveness and participation
- c) Prosperity of researchers
- d) Complementarity and responsibility at national levels

# Session I

## INPUT FROM THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION

- Concept/Definition Brain circulation: “The BALANCED movement of skilled labour (i.e. researchers) across countries”
- Concept/Definition Brain Drain: “Mobility of skilled labour away from a country without compensating inflows or return flows”
- Mobility of PhD-Students going out or going in: “picture is quite variable”, but the higher the R&I Intensity (GERD) in a country - the more inflow
- Caveats: not necessarily a zero sum game. Possible positive effects: Possible return with higher levels of knowledge/skills, knowledge remittances (main contact abroad etc.), importance of diasporas, maybe incentivize towards policy reform etc.
- **Take away: It is a question of BALANCE, pattern is mixed, not east versus west, not north versus south. Not necessarily a zero sum game. POLICY ACTION IS POSSIBLE AND NEEDED.**

# Session I

## SOME FINDINGS IN “MORE4”, INPUT BY EXPERTS (PPMI, IDEA, WIFO)

- Key indicator: Long-term mobility post PhD career stages: large “Country variety”; smaller “country variety” regarding short term mobility
- **Sending countries/receiving countries:** “Big country effect” (USA, UK and Germany are stable at receiving), “Proximity effect” (mobility to MS regionally closer, for instance regarding within Scandinavia or East to Germany); strong flow from Spain to UK (maybe “Language effect”)
- **Motivations of mobility:** “Chosen not forced”, Main factors: “INTERNATIONAL NETWORKING”; “WORKING WITH EXCELLENT SCIENTISTS”; “CAREER PROGRESSION”; “RESEARCH AUTONOMY”; so: scientific related motivation, not financial.
- Tendency regarding Choice “Outside Europe versus inside Europe”: **Europe advantage regarding framework conditions like social security, pension etc. Outside Europe advantage: Science related issues such as funding, autonomy etc.** Non-EU-countries seem still to be more attractive than EU/ERA as working place.

# Session I

## INPUT FROM IVO PILAR INSTITUTE

- CIRCULAR MIGRATION, still under discussion as concept, encompasses also high-skilled labour force, i.e. researchers, academic professionals. Reacts to and reflects the global competition for talents. In this context regarding science: among other points, social and cultural remittances, transnational social networks; diasporas to be “tapped” into.
- EAST/WEST MIGRATION SINCE 1989 covers predominantly “well educated and young people”, development has not stopped. **Still CRITICAL R&I DIVIDE BETWEEN EU15 and EU13, but data is changing, mobility data is indicating to let to go of perceptions “East - West”.**
- ROLE OF COLLABORATIVE NETWORKS. A lot of things can or should be done. Among others: **promote inclusion of the less networking researcher.** “How to...”knowledge of mobile researchers, tap into knowledge for less mobile researchers. **Circulation needs incentives** (co-authorship, co-convenings, co-submission of project proposals).
- There are already examples of MS-programmes/initiatives to promote collaborative networks that could support “brain mobility”.

# Session I

*How to assess and adjust national policies for researchers in order to best profit from the positive effects of brain circulation and reduce negative effects?*

- To support and facilitate “networking”; to recognize the experience of mobile researchers
- National funding and award system has to recognize/support “mobility”; promoting career prospects of mobile researchers (incentives, funding...); **regarding awarding „excellent science“**, issues such as Open science, education commitment etc. should be factored in.
- **Easier for a MS to incentivize the return of nationals from the outside, but second group is also important (“How to become more attractive for non-nationals?”)**, one path is “Structural/Organisational reforms” which is also positive for nationals. But also: Competitive funding, sustainable support, one option reforming national funding system to make them more comparable with EU support. Back-up funding for non-funded EU-applications (“Synergies”).
- **Soft/hard factors of a more horizontal nature (citizenship, language, working local environment, family ties, demography issues etc.) have to be taken into account.**

# Session I

*How to stimulate the creation of new diverse, inclusive and collaborative networks, and the opening up of existing ones, [...]?*

- Already some good steps forward: COST actions (role model for “open networks”) , “Advancing Europe” Package.
- **Need for national initiatives to contribute/participate/strengthen the networks which are being developed at the EU level. Also role of mobilizing Structural Funds.**
- Open question: Who does what on which level? Both national and EU action is needed.
- **Ensuring „Transparency“ and „Openness“ is key (see partnerships).**
- Soft measures are needed.

# Session II

## INPUT FROM CROATIAN NATIONAL SCIENCE FOUNDATION

- Research funding is not a luxury
- **People are the key for collaboration when attracting people (besides the attractive system)**
- Stable call dates to make predictable environment, also for researchers who are not in “the system”
- Include diaspora to be part of the system (evaluation and PhD going abroad)
- **For best results the combination of institutional and competitive funding is necessary, because:  
5-10 years stability is needed, to implement the idea and not running for projects;  
Brain circulation should be seen as broader phenomena – industry, research institutes...**

## Session II

*How to increase national commitment to the full adoption and implementation of the European Charter for Researchers and the Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers (in terms of concrete measures).*

- Discrepancy about formal fulfillment of the rules and what happens in reality;
- **1180 organizations are involved– no evaluation of the instrument till now. We need an evaluation of the instrument**
- Focus also on national implementation standards: what to improve?
- Should be introduced incentives for institutions – as part of the national system?
- **Transparency, open recruitment, clear procedures, predictable environments are the elements identified during the today's debate. They are part of the Code, but?**

# Session II

*How to improve social security for mobile researchers and move towards a European supplementary pension fund? How to influence the decision making on the portability of social security and pension schemes across borders?*

- **Legal framework is on the table, but it does not work.**
- Should be discussed in broader context - policy mix approach: we are not owners of the issue, but is of our vital interest;
- Identify what are the key factors for research – mobility is a key for excellent research
- Changing pattern of careers, mobility is a precondition – already recognised a special position of researchers – already special treatments with visas...
- **Take into account Conclusions of the Slovak presidency on Code and Resaver**



Looking forward to...



welcoming you to Croatia!



Croatian Presidency of the Council of the European Union



Hrvatsko predsjedanje Vijećem Europske unije



Présidence croate du Conseil de l'Union européenne



EU  
2020  
HR



Kroatische Vorsitz im Rat der Europäischen Union

